The Questionable Science of Community-Based Response and Social Mobilization

Sharon Abramowitz, University of Florida EboDakar 2015

What is a "community-based response?"

AKA: Why we should do ordinary medical anthropology in extraordinary epidemics.

Assumptions about Communities in Ebola Social Mobilization Campaigns

- 1. Communities are <u>adults</u>
- 2. Communities are <u>similar</u> in their vulnerability to infectious disease spread
- 3. Diagnostic practices <u>only take place</u> in the presence of trained medical professionals
- 4. Health seeking behaviors are going to divide into two liens: "traditional medicine" *or* western biomedicine.
- 5. The politics of health *happen* in the public health sector.
- 6. Communities <u>like</u> to resist stuff.
- 7. There's <u>nothing in these communities</u> to work with without foreign contributions.
- People just don't understand what we're talking about when we talk about health.

Community-based Reports of Co-morbidity and Health-Seeking Behaviors in Four Monrovia Communities During the West African Ebola Epidemic

Sharon Alane Abramowitz, PhD, MA, Kristen E. McLean, MPH, Jacob Ball, MA, MPH, Sarah Lindley McKune, PhD, MPH, Mosoka Fallah, Patricia A. Omidian, PhD

- 1. Communities are made of free and autonomous Adults.
- <u>2.</u> Communities are <u>similar</u> in their vulnerability to infectious disease spread.

Table 1: Demographic characteristics of study population by community. Count (column percent).

	Fendell (n=53)	Gbangay Town (n=69)	Saye Town (n=90)	St. Paul's Bridge (n=256)	Missing Community Information (n=37)	Overall (n=505)
Male	24 (46.2)	30 (44.1)	35 (39.8)	115 (45.8)	20 (54.1)	224 (45.2)
Female	28 (53.8)	38 (55.9)	53 (60.2)	136 (54.2)	17 (45.9)	272 (54.8)
<5 years old	12 (22.6)	11 (15.9)	11 (12.2)	39 (15.2)	6 (16.2)	79 (15.6)
6-15 years	12 (22.6)	10 (14.5)	11 (12.2)	44 (17.2)	4 (10.8)	81 (16.0)
15-45 years	13 (24.5)	29 (42.0)	37 (41.1)	104 (40.6)	22 (59.8)	205 (40.6)
>45 years	16 (30.2)	19 (27.5)	31 (34.4)	69 (27.0)	5 (13.5)	140 (27.7)
Presently sick*	43 (81.1)	50 (72.5)	69 (76.7)	160 (62.5)	28 (75.7)	350 (69.3)
Past sick*	18 (34.6)	24 (34.8)	32 (35.6)	111 (43.4)	7 (18.9)	192 (38.1)
Deceased*	0 (0)	2 (2.9)	3 (3.3)	41 (16.0)	3 (8.1)	49 (9.7)

^{*}p<0.05

3. Diagnostic practices <u>only take place</u> in the presence of trained medical professionals.

Table 2: Self-reported diagnoses for sick and diseased individuals. Count (column percent).

Diagnosis	Fendell (n=53)	Gbangay Town (n=69)	Saye Town (n=90)	St. Paul's Bridge (n=256)	Missing Community Information (n=37)	Overall (n=505)
Malaria	7	17	13	48	13	98 (13.7)
Witchcraft	1	1	1	3	0	6 (0.8)
Asthma	0	0	0	3	4	7 (1.0%)
Rheumatism	2	2	1	2	0	7 (1.0%)
Cholera	0	0	0	5	0	5 (0.7%)
Cold/Flu	0	4	3	10	4	21 (2.9%)
Diabetes/Sugar	0	1	1	3	1	6 (0.8%)
Ebola	0	0	4	9	0	13 (1.8%)
Blood Pressure	2	6	4	18	1	31 (4.3%)
Injury	3	0	0	4	0	7 (1.0%)
Typhoid	1	4	7	5	2	19 (2.7%)
Ulcer	2	0	3	2	1	8 (1.1%)

^{*}Only diagnoses with 5 or more responses are depicted

^{*61.9%} of data were missing or coded as "non-response"

4. Health seeking behaviors are going to divide into two liens: "traditional medicine" *or* Western biomedicine.

Table 3: Sick individuals' first attempt to seek care by community. Count (column percent).

		ndell mmunity	Gba	angay wn	Sa	ye Town		Paul's dge		ommunity nknown	То	tal
Hospital	7	(31.8%)	6	(46.2%)	10	(27.0%)	20	(13.2%)	2	(66.7%)	45	(19.9%)
Clinic	1	(4.5%)	0	(0.0%)	4	(10.8%)	6	(4.0%)	1	(33.3%)	12	(5.3%)
Doctor/Nurse/ GP/ PA	0	(0.0%)	1	(7.7%)	5	(13.5%)	11	(7.3%)	0	(0.0%)	17	(7.5%)
Drug Vendor/ Pharmacy	11	(50.0%)	5	(38.5%)	3	(8.1%)	77	(51.0%)	0	(0.0%)	96	(42.5%)
Ebola Hospital [#]	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	2	(5.4%)	14	(9.3%)	0	(0.0%)	16	(7.1%)
Health worker in social network	0	(0.0%)	1	(7.7%)	4	(10.8%)	2	(1.3%)	0	(0.0%)	7	(3.1%)
Herbalist/ Native Healer	2	(9.1%)	0	(0.0%)	1	(2.7%)	1	(0.7%)	0	(0.0%)	4	(1.8%)
Home Care	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	3	(8.1%)	6	(4.0%)	0	(0.0%)	9	(4.0%)
Unknown	1	(4.5%)	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	1	(0.4%)
Nothing	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	3	(8.1%)	13	(8.6%)	0	(0.0%)	16	(7.1%)
Previously Diagnosed	0	(0.0%)	0	(0.0%)	2	(5.4%)	1	(0.7%)	0	(0.0%)	3	(1.3%)
Total	22		13		37		151		3			226

[#] includes responses of "Ebola Treatment Unit", "Called Ebola team", as well as "Ebola hospital"



Peterson, Kristin.

Speculative Markets. Drug
Circuits and Derivative Life
in Nigeria. DurhamLondon, Duke University
Press, 2014.

Patterson, Donna A.

Pharmacy in Senegal.

Gender, Healing, and

Entrepreneurship. Bloomin
gton-Indianapolis, Indiana
University Press, 2015.

5. The Politics Of Health Are Happening In The Public Health Sector.

6. Communities like to resist stuff.

Table 4: Burial practices for recently deceased.

Burial Practice	Count
Ebola task force/response team took the body	19
Body was buried at the hospital	5
Family buried the body/health team did not "teach" body and left it with family	6
Buried or awaiting burial by the Burial Team	2
Body was taken to the village	1
Ebola Response Team approved a normal burial	1
Total	34

7. There's nothing in these communities to work with without foreign contributions.

Supplementary Data File 2: Qualitative Data on Treatment Sought

Treatment Code	Qualitative Details
Bought Medicine from drug vendor/drugstore /pharmacy	Aminofin, amoxicillin, amodiaquine, antacid, antibiotic, antusinate, artimeter, asthma pump, atenolol, b-complex, b-2, chloramphenicol, chloramphenamine, chloroquine, ciproflaxin, cough syrup, diclofenac, doxycycline, erythromycin, eye drops, ferrous, foliate acid, folic acid, gas syrup, glucose, levoflaxin, logma (antimalarial intravenous and tablets), metformin, metronidazole, multivitamin, glycogen, omeprazole, oral rehydration solution, pain killer tablet, paracetemol (PCM pills and syrup), quinine, reserpine, rifampin, salbutamol, septrine, spectrum, ventolin, vermox (parasites), zantac
Generic treatment purchased or obtained	Medicines, generic treatment, unknown drug, pills from drugstore, ointment, mosquito net, medicines previously prescribed by doctor, medications given by hospital, malaria medicines, injection, drugs, drip (iv fluids)
Nothing	Nothing, rest, water, nothing due to financial reasons, no drugs due to financial problems
Traditional medicine	Dried rattlesnake, hair cutting, herbs, traditional medicine, traditional healing rubbing of cheeks, Nigerian rock, herbal treatment, herbal leaves, fruits
Clinic or hospital	Generic treatment at hospital, hospitalized, generic treatment at ETU, doctor treated him
Extraordinary treatment (surgery, blood transfusion)	Blood transfusion, blood tonic, prostate operation, surgery, operation, antibodies

Treatment Code	Qualitative Details
Traument Code	Body pain, sore in legs, constant pain, leg pain, pain in
	legs, muscle pain, pain in ankles, burning pain, body
	burning, back pain, upper back pain, lower back pain,
	joint pain, bone pain, neck pain, stiff neck, pain in neck,
	waist pain, pain around waist, pain in both sides of the
Sore body/Body pain/Joint Pain/Bone Pain	waist
bore cody/body panil/oner and bone ran	Stomach pain, abdominal pain, burning pain in stomach,
	burning stomach after eating, large stomach, sore in
	stomach, ulcer, stomach turning, upset stomach, bowel
	issues, dislocating bowels while using toilet, dysentery,
	diarrhea, running stomach, toileting, watery stool,
	constipation, hardly uses the toilet, abdominal
	discomfort, gas in abdomen, belching, 'I feel like it
Stomach pain/Abdominal pain	moving up and down and I suspect that it is gas'
Bitter tongue/mouth	Bitter tongue, bitter mouth
Bleeding	Bleeding
	Vaginal bleeding, prolonged menses, sore between the
Pelvic pain/vaginal bleeding	legs
Sec. 10.	High blood pressure, low blood pressure, blood pressure
Blood pressure problems	problems, low blood, pressure
	Blurry eyes, eyes turning, eyes swinging, fluid leaking
A DELINES CONTROL OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPE	from eyes, eyes swinging when sitting or walking, eye
Vision problems	dime, eyes get dim, eyes itching
Breathing issues/Asthma	Breathing fast, fast breathing, can't breathe, asthma
	Burning sensation in chest, heart hurting, heart pain,
Chest and Heart Issues	pain in chest, fast heartbeat, heart palpitations
	Burning when peeing, difficulty with urination, urinating
	much, discolored urine, yellow urine, urinating a lot at
Urination issues	night
Lightheaded/Dizziness	Can fall off, dizziness, brain swinging
D-1-/	Burning under the feet, feet and palms burning, pain under feet
Pain/burning of Feet/Palms Cannot walk	***************************************
	Cannot walk, unable to walk, difficult to walk
Chewing of tongue	Chewing of tongue
	Chills, chills and sweats, cold sweats, sweating, profuse
Hot Skin, Chills and Sweats	sweating, shivering, hot skin, hot skin at night, hotness in body, skin feeling hot, burning skin, skin hot and cold
Headache	Headache, burning pain on forehead
Treadactic	Feels cold, feels cold in evening, feels chill, feels chill in
Cold	evening and night, chronic cold, fresh cold
Cold	Fatigue, weakness in body, feeling tired, feel weak when
Weakness/Fatigue	walking, joint weakness, neck weakness
Coughing	Coughing, excessive coughing
Crying	Crving
Yellow eyes	Yellow coloration of the eye, yellow eye, eyes yellow
Ear and Hearing issues	Ear halting, difficulty hearing, fluid from ear, ear pain
Losing consciousness/fainting	Fainting, fall off
Feeling strange	Feeling strange
Felt sick	Felt sick, he was sick, feels miserable
Fever	Fever, fever at night, light fever, high temperature
Foaming at the mouth	Foam at the mouth, fume at mouth, foaming
- Committee and models	Body halting, head halting, ear halting, heart halting,
Halting	bone halting, gum halting
He had an accident	He had an accident
	AND HAS DECEMBED.

Local Idioms of Routine Symptoms (an excerpt)

8. People just don't understand what we're talking about when we talk about health.

Alors...

What are we talking about when we talk about community-based responses to the Ebola epidemic?

Sharon Abramowitz sabramowitz@ufl.edu